

1 MESCH CLARK ROTHSCHILD
2 259 North Meyer Avenue
3 Tucson, Arizona 85701
4 Phone: (520) 624-8886
Fax: (520) 798-1037
Email: nrothschild@mcrazlaw.com
awinkelman@mcrazlaw.com
ecfpima@mcrazlaw.com

6
7 By: Nathan S. Rothschild, #29847
Alex Winkelman, #34120
8 13372-1/tl

9 Attorneys for Defendant

10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

11 **DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

12 John Ngecu Maina, a single man,

13 No. 4:24-cv-00471-SHR

14 Plaintiff,

15 **DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS**

16 vs.

17 (Assigned to Honorable Scott H. Rash)

18 Fernanda Munoz Garcia, a single woman

19 Defendant.

20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
55210
55211
55212
55213
55214
55215
55216
55217
55218
55219
55220
55221
55222
55223
55224
55225
55226
55227
55228
55229
55230
55231
55232
55233
55234
55235
55236
55237
55238
55239
55240
55241
55242
55243
55244
55245
55246
55247
55248
55249
55250
55251
55252
55253
55254
55255
55256
55257
55258
55259
55260
55261
55262
55263
55264
55265
55266
55267
55268
55269
55270
55271
55272
55273
55274
55275
55276
55277
55278
55279
55280
55281
55282
55283
55284
55285
55286
55287
55288
55289
55290
55291
55292
55293
55294
55295
55296
55297
55298
55299
552100
552101
552102
552103
552104
552105
552106
552107
552108
552109
552110
552111
552112
552113
552114
552115
552116
552117
552118
552119
552120
552121
552122
552123
552124
552125
552126
552127
552128
552129
552130
552131
552132
552133
552134
552135
552136
552137
552138
552139
552140
552141
552142
552143
552144
552145
552146
552147
552148
552149
552150
552151
552152
552153
552154
552155
552156
552157
552158
552159
552160
552161
552162
552163
552164
552165
552166
552167
552168
552169
552170
552171
552172
552173
552174
552175
552176
552177
552178
552179
552180
552181
552182
552183
552184
552185
552186
552187
552188
552189
552190
552191
552192
552193
552194
552195
552196
552197
552198
552199
552200
552201
552202
552203
552204
552205
552206
552207
552208
552209
552210
552211
552212
552213
552214
552215
552216
552217
552218
552219
552220
552221
552222
552223
552224
552225
552226
552227
552228
552229
5522210
5522211
5522212
5522213
5522214
5522215
5522216
5522217
5522218
5522219
5522220
5522221
5522222
5522223
5522224
5522225
5522226
5522227
5522228
5522229
55222210
55222211
55222212
55222213
55222214
55222215
55222216
55222217
55222218
55222219
55222220
55222221
55222222
55222223
55222224
55222225
55222226
55222227
55222228
55222229
552222210
552222211
552222212
552222213
552222214
552222215
552222216
552222217
552222218
552222219
552222220
552222221
552222222
552222223
552222224
552222225
552222226
552222227
552222228
552222229
5522222210
5522222211
5522222212
5522222213
5522222214
5522222215
5522222216
5522222217
5522222218
5522222219
5522222220
5522222221
5522222222
5522222223
5522222224
5522222225
5522222226
5522222227
5522222228
5522222229
55222222210
55222222211
55222222212
55222222213
55222222214
55222222215
55222222216
55222222217
55222222218
55222222219
55222222220
55222222221
55222222222
55222222223
55222222224
55222222225
55222222226
55222222227
55222222228
55222222229
552222222210
552222222211
552222222212
552222222213
552222222214
552222222215
552222222216
552222222217
552222222218
552222222219
552222222220
552222222221
552222222222
552222222223
552222222224
552222222225
552222222226
552222222227
552222222228
552222222229
5522222222210
5522222222211
5522222222212
5522222222213
5522222222214
5522222222215
5522222222216
5522222222217
5522222222218
5522222222219
5522222222220
5522222222221
5522222222222
5522222222223
5522222222224
5522222222225
5522222222226
5522222222227
5522222222228
5522222222229
55222222222210
55222222222211
55222222222212
55222222222213
55222222222214
55222222222215
55222222222216
55222222222217
55222222222218
55222222222219
55222222222220
55222222222221
55222222222222
55222222222223
55222222222224
55222222222225
55222222222226
55222222222227
55222222222228
55222222222229
552222222222210
552222222222211
552222222222212
552222222222213
552222222222214
552222222222215
552222222222216
552222222222217
552222222222218
552222222222219
552222222222220
552222222222221
552222222222222
552222222222223
552222222222224
552222222222225
552222222222226
552222222222227
552222222222228
552222222222229
5522222222222210
5522222222222211
5522222222222212
5522222222222213
5522222222222214
5522222222222215
5522222222222216
5522222222222217
5522222222222218
5522222222222219
5522222222222220
5522222222222221
5522222222222222
5522222222222223
5522222222222224
5522222222222225
5522222222222226
5522222222222227
5522222222222228
5522222222222229
55222222222222210
55222222222222211
55222222222222212
55222222222222213
55222222222222214
55222222222222215
55222222222222216
55222222222222217
55222222222222218
55222222222222219
55222222222222220
55222222222222221
55222222222222222
55222222222222223
55222222222222224
55222222222222225
55222222222222226
55222222222222227
55222222222222228
55222222222222229
552222222222222210
552222222222222211
552222222222222212
552222222222222213
552222222222222214
552222222222222215
552222222222222216
552222222222222217
552222222222222218
552222222222222219
552222222222222220
552222222222222221
552222222222222222
552222222222222223
552222222222222224
552222222222222225
552222222222222226
552222222222222227
552222222222222228
552222222222222229
5522222222222222210
5522222222222222211
5522222222222222212
5522222222222222213
5522222222222222214
5522222222222222215
5522222222222222216
5522222222222222217
5522222222222222218
5522222222222222219
5522222222222222220
5522222222222222221
5522222222222222222
5522222222222222223
5522222222222222224
5522222222222222225
5522222222222222226
5522222222222222227
5522222222222222228
5522222222222222229
55222222222222222210
55222222222222222211
55222222222222222212
55222222222222222213
55222222222222222214
55222222222222222215
55222222222222222216
55222222222222222217
55222222222222222218
55222222222222222219
55222222222222222220
55222222222222222221
55222222222222222222
55222222222222222223
55222222222222222224
55222222222222222225
55222222222222222226
55222222222222222227
55222222222222222228
55222222222222222229
552222222222222222210
552222222222222222211
552222222222222222212
552222222222222222213
552222222222222222214
552222222222222222215
552222222222222222216
552222222222222222217
552222222222222222218
552222222222222222219
552222222222222222220
552222222222222222221
552222222222222222222
552222222222222222223
552222222222222222224
552222222222222222225
552222222222222222226
552222222222222222227
552222222222222222228
552222222222222222229
5522222222222222222210
5522222222222222222211
5522222222222222222212
5522222222222222222213
5522222222222222222214
5522222222222222222215
5522222222222222222216
5522222222222222222217
5522222222222222222218
5522222222222222222219
5522222222222222222220
5522222222222222222221
5522222222222222222222
5522222222222222222223
5522222222222222222224
5522222222222222222225
5522222222222222222226
5522222222222222222227
5522222222222222222228
5522222222222222222229
55222222222222222222210
55222222222222222222211
55222222222222222222212
55222222222222222222213
55222222222222222222214
55222222222222222222215
55222222222222222222216
55222222222222222222217
55222222222222222222218
55222222222222222222219
55222222222222222222220
55222222222222222222221
55222222222222222222222
55222222222222222222223
55222222222222222222224
55222222222222222222225
55222222222222222222226
55222222222222222222227
55222222222222222222228
55222222222222222222229
552222222222222222222210
552222222222222222222211
552222222222222222222212
552222222222222222222213
552222222222222222222214
552222222222222222222215
552222222222222222222216
552222222222222222222217
552222222222222222222218
552222222222222222222219
552222222222222222222220
552222222222222222222221
552222222222222222222222
552222222222222222222223
55222

intimidated and damaged the plaintiff character and reputation through telephone and internet-based provider.

6. Fernanda Garcia Munoz was a paralegal assigned to handle the plaintiffs case while she was obtaining her law degree. But it was removed. for Unknown reasons. Paralegals, judges and appointed lawyers have an oath to keep and a duty to uphold to their clients. Her actions were not only a breach to her duty, but it was also a crime. The broadcast was so descriptive the plaintiff was able to capture this audio through his phone

Thus, it appears the only allegations in the Complaint against Defendant are (1) that she “broadcast” a statement in LAX and (2) that Defendant was reassigned from Plaintiff’s case while a paralegal.

II. Counts Alleged in the Complaint

The Complaint appears to allege four categories of counts against Defendant. The first is a claim under Title 18 U.S.C. § 2520 in violation of the Wiretap Act. This claim requires a plaintiff to show a defendant “intercepted, disclosed, or intentionally used” a “wire, oral, or electronic communication.”

The second apparent claim in the Complaint is a violation of Arizona's ethical rules for government attorneys. Specifically, it appears that Plaintiff is suing for violations of ER 8.4 and ER 1.9 for "violat[ing] or attempting to violat[ing] the rules of professional conduct." (Complaint p. 5).

The third apparent claim in the Complaint is for violation of ARS §13-2916 which provides for the criminal prosecution of person who: (1) directs any obscene, lewd or profane language or suggest any lewd or lascivious act to a person via the use of electronic communication; (2) threatens to inflict physical harm to a person or property in any electronic communications, (3) disturbs a person's peace or privacy via repeated anonymous, unwanted, or unsolicited electronic communications, and/or (4) uses an

1 electronic communication device to electronically distribute, publish, email, hyperlink or
 2 make available for downloading the person's personal identifying information, including a
 3 digital image of the person, and the use does in fact incite or produce that unwanted physical
 4 contact, injury or harassment.

5 **III. Rule 12 Standard**

6 Although this Court will construe pro se litigant's pleadings liberally, see *Karim-*
Panahi v. L.A. Police Dep't, 839 F.2d 621, 623 (9th Cir. 1988), "[t]hreadbare recitals of the
 8 elements of a cause of action, supported by mere conclusory statements, do not suffice" to
 9 survive Rule 12(b)(6)'s requirements. *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556 U.S. 662, 678 (2009). A
 10 complaint suggesting the "mere possibility of misconduct" or providing "unadorned, the-
 11 defendant-unlawfully-harmed-me accusation[s]" does not satisfy *Iqbal's* plausibility
 12 standard. *Id.* at 678-79. "In sum, for a complaint to survive a motion to dismiss, the non-
 13 conclusory 'factual content,' and reasonable inferences from that content, must be plausibly
 14 suggestive of a claim entitling the plaintiff to relief." *Moss v. U.S. Secret Service*, 572 F.3d
 15 962 (9th Cir. 2009). In dismissing for failure to state a claim under Rule 12(b)(6), 'a district
 16 court should grant leave to amend even if no request to amend the pleading was made, this
 17 Court should not grant leave to amend if "it determines that the pleading could not possibly
 18 be cured by the allegation of other facts.'" *Lopez v. Smith*, 203 F.3d 1122, 1127 (9th Cir.
 19 2000).

20 **IV. Argument**

21 Two categories of claims must be dismissed as a matter of law because there is no
 22 private right of action. First, there is no private right of action in A.R.S. 13-2916 and claims
 23 brought under criminal statutes without an express private right of action can be dismissed
 24 under Rule 12(b)(6). See, e.g., *Phx. Baptist Hosp. & Med. Ctr., Inc. v. Aiken*, 179 Ariz. 289,
 25 294 (App. 1994) ("The general rule is that 'no private cause of action should be inferred
 26

1 based on a criminal statute[.]’ ”);. *Wilcox v. First Interstate Bank*, 815 F.2d 522, 533 n.1
2 (9th Cir. 1987). This claim must be dismissed.

3 Likewise, “State ethics rules do not, of course, create private rights of action for
4 aggrieved clients.” *Cecala v. Newman*, 532 F.Supp.2d 1118, 1141 (D. Ariz. 2007). “With
5 few exceptions, the courts agree that the violation of an ethics rule alone does not create
6 a cause of action, constitute legal malpractice *per se* or necessarily create a duty.” 2 *Legal*
7 *Malpractice* § 19:7 at 1208. “The Arizona Supreme Court expressly aligned itself with this
8 majority view when it ‘declined to use the court’s own ethical standards as a basis upon
9 which to impose legal malpractice liability.’” *Cecala*, quoting *Stanley v. McCarver*, 208
10 Ariz. 219, 225 n. 6 92 P.3d 849, 855 n. 6 (2004) (citing Ariz. R. Sup.Ct. 42, R. Prof. Resp.,
11 Preamble, Scope ¶ 20 (noting that rules of professional responsibility “are not designed to
12 be a basis for civil liability”)).

13 These alleged claims must be dismissed as a matter of law, even without regard to the
14 sufficiency of the factual allegations in the complaint, which are also deficient. Neither of
15 the allegations complain of legal violations nor to private rights of actions. Plaintiff does not
16 identify any facts which would plausibly establish that Defendant violated Arizona’s ethical
17 rules, or that she harassed or terrified Plaintiff using an electronic communication. The only
18 allegation is that Defendant “broadcast” threatening and offensive hate speech, but simply
19 alleging that speech is threatening or offensive amounts to conclusory language that cannot
20 satisfy the requirements of Rules 8 and 12, FRCP.

21 Finally, this Court should dismiss the claim under 18 U.S.C. § 2520 as well, as that
22 statute relates not to the transmission of a wire, but instead relates to the “intercept[ion] of
23 an electronic communication. Even assuming arguendo that the Defendant “broadcast” a
24 communication in Los Angeles International Airport, that would not violate 18 U.S.C. §
25 2520. Plaintiff has not alleged any facts which could permit a verdict in Plaintiff’s favor
26 under Section 2520. Additionally, even if Plaintiff had brought different claims, Plaintiff has

1 failed to set forth sufficient factual details to reach plausibility: Plaintiff has not identified
2 the content of the communication, Plaintiff has not identified with any specificity when the
3 communication was made, and Plaintiff has not explained how a “telephone and internet-
4 based provider” were involved. While the complaint need not contain all evidence required
5 to establish Plaintiff’s claims, the complaint in this case contains nearly no facts which
6 establish plausibility.

7 **V. Conclusion**

8 Plaintiff fails to properly plead any claims which should be permitted to move
9 forward. None of the claims identified in the complaint are legally viable and must be
10 dismissed, and it would be futile to allow amendment as to these claims.

11
12 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 30th day of September, 2024.

13
14
15 MESCH CLARK ROTHSCHILD

16
17 By: /s/ Alex Winkelman
18 Nathan S. Rothschild
19 Alex Winkelman
Counsel for Defendant

20 COPY OF THE FOREGOING mailed/mailed
21 this 30th day of September, 2024, to:

22 John Ngecu Maina
23 2218 Hatties Place Rd.
Knoxville, TN 37931
Mrfarmer29@outlook.com
24 *Defendant/Pro Se*

25 /s/ Traci Lopez
26 4872-7597-1051, v. 1